

PORT AUTHORITY OF ALLEGHENY COUNTY  
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR BOARD MEETING  
FRIDAY, OCTOBER 25, 2019

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Port Authority of Allegheny County was held on Friday, October 25, 2019 at 9:30 a.m. at the Authority's Administration Offices, 345 Sixth Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, 15222-2527, pursuant to due public notice given as required by law.

**Board Members**

Jeff Letwin, Chair  
Jennifer Liptak  
Michelle Zmijanac  
John Tague  
Stephanie Turman  
Ann Ogoreuc  
Senator Jim Brewster  
Representative Lori Mizgorski  
Representative Austin Davis  
Joel Lennen, General Counsel

**Media**

Ed Blazina, Post-Gazette

**Port Authority Staff**

Katharine Kelleman, chief executive officer, Vasti Amaro, chief of staff, Mike Cetra, chief legal officer, David Huffaker, chief development officer, Jim Ritchie, chief communications officer, Maurice Bell, chief operations officer, Adam Brandolph, Public Relations manager, Jeffrey Devlin, chief information officer, Don Rivetti, deputy chief operations officer Maintenance, Inez Colon, chief Human Resources officer, Darcy Cleaver, assistant manager Passenger Amenities, John Beeler, manager Customer Service, Melissa Dunbar, contract specialist Professional Services, Keith Wargo, chief engineer, Kim Zelen, manager Contract Administration Construction, Shelley Wolf, assistant manager Customer Sales, Jerimaine Ward, manager Contract Administration, Michael Heidkamp, deputy chief operations officer Transportation, Kathy Lucas, Administrative Assistant, Diane Williamson, executive assistant.

**Customer Service Representatives Recognized**

Serena Hart  
Candace Bair  
Victor Billberry  
Ebony Chapman

**Other**

Carolyn Lenigan, Dave Haines AECOM, Claire Kealey, PCRG, Laura Wiens, PPT, Jim Keener, ACTC, Ramesh Bhambwani, Speaker, Bob Hurley, GAI Consultants, Jeff Hans, HDR, Lisa Gonzalez, PPT, Charles Vogel, O'Hara Township, Regina Thornton, Cassandra Masters, ACCESS, Dan Yablonski, PPT.

The Chair called the October 25, 2019 Regular Meeting of the Board to order.

Following the pledge of allegiance, a recommendation was made for approval of the minutes of the September 27, 2019 Regular Meeting. A motion was made, seconded and unanimously passed.

The Chair called on Ms. Kelleman for the report of the Chief Executive Officer.

Ms. Kelleman started her report by asking for a moment of silence as she read the names of the employees and former employees that passed in September: Repairperson Frank Spiker; Laborer Raymond Hernandez; First Line Supervisor Michael Waller; and operators Joseph McLaughlin, Cerise Brown, John Mack, Andrew Jackson, Joyce Fernacz and Lawrence Williams. Ms. Kelleman noted that we are also one year out from the Tree of Life shooting last year.

Ms. Kelleman shared information regarding our Bus Stop Consolidation Program which was kicked off with public signage about six weeks ago. We have been looking at reducing the number of stops in our system for a long time. In exchange, we are working on making the remaining stops a better place for someone to catch the bus. So someone may travel farther, but the stop that they're going to will have better qualities and better amenities.

Ms. Kelleman noted that this is clearly not easy. Every single stop represents an opportunity for some to access our system. This is something that affects our patrons' lives and, of course, they are very concerned and focused on how we are going to interact with them at these stops, and we understand that. We understand that different stops impact people in different ways.

Ms. Kelleman reported that one item that the Board was very clear on when she was brought onboard was to focus on the customer experience, and that involves many aspects. We have over 7,000 stops in our system, and our commitment needs to be to having stops that are well-spaced but very usable with good infrastructure connected to good sidewalks and curb cuts. This is compounded by the fact we inherited a public transit system that had nearly 40 separate systems coming back together that brought different philosophies of how to place stops. We have stops that are difficult to get to in some places. She added patrons deserve better.

Ms. Kelleman added that we have also heard from patrons that they would like to see faster service, and having a stop on every corner has probably been seen as an impediment to getting us back on to our schedules. Ms. Kelleman continued reporting that we've been very generous over the years. When we couldn't add service, we would add a bus stop. When we couldn't fix a schedule, we would add a bus stop. When we couldn't get you to where you wanted to go quickly enough, we gave you a bus stop. Again, patrons deserve better. You deserve a network that's well thought out and gets you to where you need to go in a reasonable amount of time.

Katharine said this was not easy but we have looked at best practices. There is a document which was recently linked online through Transit Center, which sets forth the principles of placing a bus stop, and we have hit every single pillar in that. We have spoken with the Scheduling Committees at all four of our bus garages and have solicited our operators broadly for input.

We know that there have been requests for us to have a meeting, but where would we have this meeting? While it would be great to have a meeting at every single bus stop, that's simply not feasible. So while we have had meetings be very successful on other projects, here, we are providing a lot of pre-information through various media outlets, our website, our community groups, reaching out directly to our elected officials and hanging signs on bus stops. We've received feedback on a lot of stops and it has helped us make some tough decisions.

Ms. Kelleman stated that she is very pleased with the information we have received and very pleased with the process. It has led us to being able to keep some stops and make some plans in the future

for some infrastructure improvements. We are listening and we do care. Your opinion makes a difference, and it impacts how your service is delivered to you.

Ms. Kelleman stated that as we go to our next round of stops on our next routes, we will be sure to provide details and share a little bit more on the process we are following, and we appreciate everybody working with us.

Next, Ms. Kelleman reported that Port Authority celebrated Customer Service week October 7 through October 11. Customer service and the customer experience are the core of what we do, whether to a patron, a business partner or an employee.

Our Customer Service and Service Centers do so much more than just sit on the phone. They wayfind. They do crisis intervention. They help with trip planning. They respond to customers now on Twitter and LiveChat, not to mention get people through Light-Up Night and Steelers games.

At this time, Ms. Kelleman recognized four Customer Service employees who have received the most commendations in their department in the past year. They are Serena Hart, Candace Bair, Victor Billberry and Ebony Chapman. Mr. JaRonte Bryant was unable to attend the meeting, but we'd also like to recognize him from the Service Center.

Katharine concluded her report by personally thanking each of them for all the wonderful things they do. The work and the service we provide is useless without the work you are doing.

That concluded the report of the Chief Executive Officer.

Mr. Letwin stated that on behalf of the Board, we thank you also for the great work that you do to make this whole organization great.

In a departure from normal practice, Mr. Letwin then called on Mr. James Keener to come up and address the Board regarding Service Guidelines.

Mr. Keener addressed the Board regarding his concerns with Port Authority's Service Guidelines, now referred to as Service Standards. Mr. Keener stated that the 2015 and 2017 editions, let alone this 2019 edition, aren't even service minimums. In his opinion, he pointed out that the 2019 standards have made all maximum service frequencies for local routes worse. Mr. Keener proceeded to compare Port Authority's standards with the Transportation Research Board's, which serves the National Academies of Sciences and Engineering, Quality Service Manual. Mr. Keener noted that our service standards should reflect our measures, our expectations, our standards for good service. He said that his is not calling for five-minute headways on every route, he is simply stating that we should expect better than calling unusable service acceptable. Our service standards should allow us to identify problems so that we can remediate them. Sometimes it requires making difficult choices, like you're doing with the Bus Stop Consolidation Program. Sometimes it is just not possible and we need to document why. However, if our standards don't allow us to identify routes that are bad, there will never be a reason to be better.

The Chair called on Ms. Zmijanac for a report of the Performance Oversight Committee. Ms. Zmijanac reported that the Performance Oversight Committee met on October 17 and had a few items to report.

Ms. Zmijanac reported that at the meeting, Chief Financial Officer, Peter Schenk, reported that for the month of September 2019, Total Operating Income exceeded budget by \$351,170. Passenger Revenue was predominantly responsible for this exceedance. For the fiscal year, Total Operating Income exceeds budget by approximately \$458,000 due to higher passenger revenues and interest income.

Total Expenses for the month of September were reported at \$2.3 million under budget. For a year-to-date perspective, Total Expenses are \$10.2 million under budget. Total Subsidies for the month were approximately \$399,300 above budget, but he explained that this will normalize by fiscal year end.

There were two resolutions reviewed by the Performance Oversight Committee.

The Performance Oversight Committee first reviewed eight procurement items and determined the bids to be in accordance with the Authority's procurement policies and procedures, the prices to be fair and reasonable, the bidders to be responsible and the bids responsive.

The Performance Oversight Committee recommended for award the eight items listed in the resolution for the total amount of approximately \$3.7 million dollars.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Ms. Zmijanac respectfully requested approval of the resolution. It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved as presented.

Ms. Zmijanac presented the other resolution for consideration seeking Authorization to Enter into a First Amendment to the Funding Agreement with the Stadium Authority of the City of Pittsburgh.

It was reported at the meeting that in April 2015, the Board approved entering into an agreement with the Stadium Authority to fund free fares at the North Side Station from April 2015 through March 31, 2020, for an agreed-upon amount paid to Port Authority by the Stadium Authority. Port Authority and the Stadium Authority have negotiated a proposed amendment to extend the Funding Agreement for one year while staff continues to review Port Authority's fare policy.

The Performance Oversight Committee recommended that Port Authority enter into the First Amendment with the Stadium Authority to extend the term for one year through March 31, 2021 for a total amount of \$265,000 payable to Port Authority by the Stadium Authority.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Ms. Zmijanac respectfully requested approval of the resolution. It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved as presented.

That concluded the report of the Performance Oversight Committee.

The Chair called on Mr. Tague for a report of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee. Mr. Tague reported that the Committee met last week and he had three items and a resolution for the Board's consideration.

Mr. Tague reported that the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee were presented with three updates from the Planning and Development Division.

The first update given was in regard to Long Range Planning. It was reported that the RFP is underway and currently in an evaluation phase. Staff anticipates bringing a presentation to the Board in the First Quarter of 2020.

The next update was regarding the Bus Rapid Transit project. Staff is seeking feedback on station and shelter designs through an online survey. Feedback is appreciated.

The third update consisted of the Agency Tactical Plan. The plan kicked-off in September 2018 with five key areas of focus, one for each division. Staff spent the past year focusing on the Tactical Plan by developing programs and making significant improvements to these areas. In December, staff will shift from the tactical plan to developing a Strategic Plan.

Next, Mr. Tague presented a resolution for consideration seeking authorization to adopt the amended Transit Service Guidelines.

Port Authority follows the basic guidelines that service must be efficient, effective and equitable. Routes that do not meet the basic standards for productivity will be identified in the Annual Service Report, along with an explanation regarding plans for improvements.

The amended service standards will help to enhance transparency and increase the level of public outreach. Staff assessed the current service guidelines and made the following recommendations:

Converting the name of Service Guidelines to Service Standards; updating route types to be more consistent with the National Association of City Transportation Standards; adjusting on-time performance standards for commuter routes to 80 percent and revising the timeline for service requests to better align with the Authority's budget process and enhance public outreach.

The Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee recommends adopting the amended Transit Service Standards.

On behalf of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee, Mr. Tague respectfully requested approval of the resolution. It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved as presented.

As there were no additional committee reports or new business, the Chair moved onto the balance of the public comment.

The Chair called on the first speaker, Mr. Ramesh Bhambwani. Mr. Bhambwani addressed the Board with his concerns of not having late weekday or weekend service on Route 36. He also brought attention to his concerns with the unsafe bus stop where there is no traffic light and is hard to get to by crossing the road.

Mr. Letwin called on the second speaker, Ms. Lisa Gonzalez. Ms. Gonzalez addressed the Board with her concerns with some of the bus stop eliminations happening in the Carrick area. She stated that this will be a hardship for the number of senior citizens and other people that use these stops. Ms. Gonzalez and her neighbors use the stop near the food pantry to bring their food home. She urged the Board to relook at the decision to eliminate the stops in Carrick.

The final speaker to address the Board was Mr. Charles Vogel, Vice President of Council for O'Hara Township and a Port Authority bus rider. He noted that the township meets regularly with the RIDC Business Alliance to discuss improvements to the RIDC Park, including bus service. The group recently offered some suggestion to Port Authority to improve service in the park. We heard nothing back from Port Authority until recently when, without any further conversation, we were informed that Port Authority would not be implementing our suggested improvement but instead, they are going to eliminate access to the park.

The service cancellation to the park affects his commute from RIDC Park to downtown. He stated that Port Authority recommends he drives three miles to the park and ride, noting that once he is in his car, he will continue driving into town.

He concluded his remarks by stating that as much as these change inconvenience his commute, there are many workers in the RIDC for whom the bus is not a convenience but a necessity. He urged the Board to meet with O'Hara Township and the RIDC Business Alliance to discuss these changes.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next Regular Meeting of the Board will be Friday, November 22, 2019.